

Vicarious Liability for Group Torts



SARA SPIRO SVENDSEN

Vicarious Liability for Group Torts

Ex Tuto
PUBLISHING
www.extuto.com

Sara Spiro Svendsen
Vicarious Liability for Group Torts
First edition, first imprint

This book was published in August 2023 by Ex TUTO PUBLISHING A/S. Design and typesetting by MERE.INFO A/S, which has used LibreOffice for Linux and the typefaces Baskerville Original and Cronos designed in 2000 and 1996 by FRANTIŠEK ŠTORM and ROBERT SLIMBACH, respectively. The book is printed in Denmark on Munken Pure 120 g/m² by NARAYANA PRESS, and the binding is carried out by BUCHBINDEREI S.R. BÜGE GMBH.

We have made this book from FSC-certified paper to support sustainable forest management.

Copyright © 2023 the author
Printed in Denmark 2023
ISBN 978-87-420-0057-1

Ex Tuto Publishing A/S
Toldbodgade 55, 1.
DK-1253 København K
www.extuto.com



Published with support from



DREYERSFOND

FairPublishing

Outline Contents

	PART I: METHODOLOGY	1
1	Background and Methodology	3
2	The Theory of Conflicting Rules	23
	PART II: THE PROBLEM OF GROUP TORTS	49
3	Evolution of Corporate Liability and Non-Liability	51
4	Limited Liability and Group Torts	77
	PART III: CURRENT STRATEGIES TO COUNTER THE GROUP-TORT PROBLEM	99
5	Veil Piercing	101
6	Direct Tort Law	139
	PART IV: VICARIOUS LIABILITY AS A POSSIBLE STRATEGY	165
7	Vicarious Liability	167
8	The Exclusionary Effect of Company Law Liability	199
9	A Natural Evolution of Vicarious Liability	221

	PART V: CONCLUSION	233
10	Conclusion	235

Contents

PART I: METHODOLOGY	1
1 Background and Methodology	3
1.1. Introduction	3
1.2. Problem Definition and Research Questions	5
1.3. Methodology	7
1.3.1. Fundamental Research ('Grundlagenforschung')	8
1.3.2. Legal Dogmatic Approach	10
1.4. Scope and Delimitation	11
1.5. Necessary Definitions and Terminological Considerations	12
1.5.1. Corporate Groups	12
1.5.2. Tort, Tort Creditors and Group Torts	13
1.5.3. Vicarious Liability	14
1.6. State of the Art	18
1.7. Outline	21
2 The Theory of Conflicting Rules	23
2.1. Introduction	23
2.2. Overlapping Norms and Norm Conflicts	24
2.2.1. Overarching Paradigm of Norm Overlaps and Norm Conflicts	24
2.2.2. Placing Concurrency Theory within the Overarching Paradigm of Norm Overlaps	27
2.2.3. Concurrency Theory's Relevance to Certain Norm Conflicts	31
2.3. Concurrency Theory Applied – Breach of Contract and Tort	32
2.3.1. The Conflict between Contract and Tort	32
2.3.2. The Non-Cumul Doctrine	35
2.3.3. Anspruchskonkurrenz, Concurrent Liability, and Konkurrenzcelære	40
2.4. Choosing the Right Approach	44

	PART II: THE PROBLEM OF GROUP TORTS	49
3	Evolution of Corporate Liability and Non-Liability	51
3.1.	Introduction	51
3.2.	Evolution of the Corporation as a Potential Subject of Liability and Limited Liability	53
3.2.1.	First Period: 1600–1800	53
3.2.2.	Second Period: 1780–1880	59
3.2.3.	Third Period: 1865–2020	68
3.3.	Conclusion	75
4	Limited Liability and Group Torts	77
4.1.	Introduction	77
4.2.	Judgment Proofing the Group	78
4.3.	The Traditional Rationale for Limited Liability	80
4.3.1.	A Rationale for Limited Liability based on the Contractual Creditor	80
4.3.2.	Limited Liability in the Context of Corporate Groups	84
4.4.	A Revised Rationale for Limited Liability in Context of Torts	87
4.4.1.	The Theory of Liability Equilibrium	87
4.4.2.	Imbalance in the Liability Equilibrium	88
4.5.	Current Strategies and Proposals for Reform	91
4.5.1.	Company Law Strategies and Direct Tort Law	91
4.5.2.	Proposals for Reform	94
4.6.	Conclusion	97
	PART III: CURRENT STRATEGIES TO COUNTER THE GROUP-TORT PROBLEM	99
5	Veil Piercing	101
5.1.	Introduction	101
5.2.	Entity Liability and Enterprise Liability	103
5.3.	Company Law-Based Group Liability in Different Jurisdictions	106
5.3.1.	United States of America	106
5.3.2.	England	111
5.3.3.	Germany	117
5.3.4.	Denmark	123
5.4.	A Common Core	131
5.5.	Does Veil Piercing Counter the Liability Issues of Corporate Groups?	135
5.6.	Conclusion	137

6	Direct Tort Law	139
6.1.	Introduction	139
6.2.	General Rules and Considerations	140
6.3.	A Trend Toward Foreign Direct Liability	143
6.4.	National Direct Liability	149
6.4.1.	Denmark	149
6.4.2.	England	153
6.5.	A Movement Toward National Direct Liability	159
6.6.	Conclusion	163
	 PART IV: VICARIOUS LIABILITY AS A POSSIBLE STRATEGY	 165
7	Vicarious Liability	167
7.1.	Introduction	167
7.2.	General Considerations behind Vicarious Liability	169
7.3.	The Distinction Between Agents, Employees, and Independent Contractors	173
7.3.1.	Employee v Agent	174
7.3.2.	Employee v Independent Contractor	178
7.4.	Employer Liability	179
7.4.1.	Denmark	179
7.4.2.	England	181
7.4.3.	United States of America	186
7.5.	Other Bases of Vicarious Liability	189
7.5.1.	Independent Contractors	189
7.5.2.	The Tort of an Agent	194
7.5.3.	Product Liability Law	196
7.6.	Conclusion	197

8	The Exclusionary Effect of Company Law Liability	199
8.1.	Introduction	199
8.2.	The Relevant Conflict	201
8.3.	Concurrency Theory as the Relevant Framework	203
8.3.1.	Choosing the Relevant Approach	203
8.3.2.	The English Experience with Direct Liability	204
8.3.3.	A Choice of Action Approach as a General Framework	206
8.4.	Vicarious Liability: An Exception to the Choice of Action Approach?	208
8.4.1.	Exceptions to the Choice of Action Approach	208
8.4.2.	Exhaustion	210
	8.4.2.1. The Same Rule	211
	8.4.2.2. Circumvention	213
8.4.3.	Erosion	216
	8.4.3.1. Limitation concerning Parent Companies	217
	8.4.3.2. Limitation to Tort Creditors with No Contractual Relationship to the Parent	218
8.5.	Conclusion	219
9	A Natural Evolution of Vicarious Liability	221
9.1.	Introduction	221
9.2.	The Current Status of Vicarious Liability	222
9.3.	Direct Liability: Evolution Through the Back Door?	225
9.4.	Would Vicarious Liability Create Balance in the Liability Equilibrium?	228
9.5.	Conclusion	231
	PART V: CONCLUSION	233
10	Conclusion	235
	<i>Table of Cases</i>	239
	<i>Bibliography</i>	249