

# Contents

ABSTRACT	5
PREFACE	6
ABBREVIATIONS	16
<b>1. Research Design</b>	<b>19</b>
1.1 The subject matter in context	19
1.1.1 Background	19
1.1.2 Two legal orders in the same legal space	24
1.1.3 Previous research	26
1.2 Aim and approach	28
1.2.1 Aim	28
1.2.2 Approach	29
1.3 Delimitations	31
1.3.1 Overview of delimitations	31
1.3.2 Health-related direct-to-consumer genetic testing	31
1.3.3 Areas of law	34
1.3.4 Actors of interest	34
1.3.5 Direct-to-consumer genetic testing and relevant convergences	35
1.3.6 The role of national legal orders in the research	36
1.4 A note on the use of language	37
1.5 Methodological approach and materials	38
1.6 Outline	41
<b>2. Theoretical and practical approaches to the coexistence of the Council of Europe and the EU in regulating health-related direct-to-consumer genetic testing</b>	<b>43</b>
2.1 Introductory remarks	43
2.2 State sovereignty and legal pluralism as analytical tools	44
2.2.1 Bringing together the incompatible	44
2.2.2 State sovereignty	45
2.2.3 Legal pluralism	48
2.3 The Sovereign and the Council of Europe	51
2.3.1 Coexistence of the Council of Europe and the Member States	51

2.3.2	Coexistence of the ECHR and the Member States	53
2.3.2.1	The ECHR regime: an overview	53
2.3.2.2	The ECHR and the national legal orders	55
2.3.2.3	Steering the coexistence	57
2.3.2.3.1	<i>Doctrines of interest</i>	57
2.3.2.3.2	<i>Living instrument doctrine</i>	59
2.3.2.3.3	<i>European Consensus</i>	62
2.3.2.3.4	<i>Margin of appreciation</i>	63
2.4	The Sovereign and the EU	68
2.4.1	Coexistence of the EU and the Member States	68
2.4.2	Doctrinal interpretations of some of the fundamental principles in the EU legal order	73
2.4.2.1	Doctrines and principles of interest	73
2.4.2.2	Primacy	74
2.4.2.3	Direct effect, consistent interpretation, and direct applicability	75
2.5	The coexistence of the Council of Europe and the EU from the perspective of legal pluralism	77
2.5.1	Theoretical considerations	77
2.5.2	The avenues of interaction in the Council of Europe legal order	79
2.5.2.1	The regulatory avenue	79
2.5.2.2	Interpretation and enforcement	80
2.5.3	The avenues of interaction in the EU legal order	82
2.5.3.1	Legislative: accession	82
2.5.3.2	Legislative: incorporation	83
2.5.3.3	Interpretation and enforcement	84
2.6	Summary and a look ahead	86
<b>3.</b>	<b>Market aspects and direct-to-consumer genetic testing</b>	<b>89</b>
3.1	Introductory remarks	89
3.2	Genetic testing and quality	90
3.3	Human genome, health matters and other traits	94
3.3.1	The relevance of scientific background	94
3.3.2	It is all in the genes. What are they?	95
3.3.3	Single-gene disorders	97
3.3.4	Multifactorial and polygenic disorders	98
3.3.5	Genes, traits, skills, behaviour, and health	100
3.4	From cellular samples to genetic information	103
3.4.1	Technology	103
3.4.2	Interpreting direct-to-consumer genetic testing results	105
3.5	Establishing the market parameter	107

## CONTENTS

<b>4. Privacy and direct-to-consumer genetic testing</b>	<b>109</b>
4.1 Introductory remarks	109
4.2 Conceptual foundations of privacy	111
4.2.1 The vague and evanescent concept of privacy	111
4.2.2 Examining privacy	114
4.2.2.1 The multiplicity of approaches to privacy	114
4.2.2.2 The right to be let alone	115
4.2.2.3 Limited access to the self	117
4.2.2.4 Secrecy	119
4.2.2.5 Control over personal information	120
4.2.2.6 Personhood	121
4.2.2.7 Intimacy	122
4.2.2.8 Synthesis of findings	123
4.3 Value-based approach to privacy	124
4.4 Privacy and direct-to-consumer genetic testing	129
4.4.1 Key challenges to privacy	129
4.4.2 Cellular samples and direct-to-consumer genetic testing	129
4.4.3 Consent	131
4.4.3.1 Relevance of consent	131
4.4.3.2 The current practice	133
4.4.3.3 Elements of consent	135
4.4.3.4 Respect for choice	137
4.5 Establishing the assessment parameter of privacy	137
<b>5. The Council of Europe’s legal space and the boundaries of the Member States’ external sovereignty</b>	<b>139</b>
5.1 Introductory remarks	139
5.2 Direct-to-consumer genetic testing as a practice of biology and medicine	140
5.2.1 Relevant instruments	140
5.2.2 Biomedicine Convention and direct-to-consumer genetic testing	141
5.2.3 Additional Protocol on Genetic Testing and direct-to-consumer genetic testing	144
5.3 Data protection regulatory framework in relation to direct-to-consumer genetic testing	148
5.3.1 Relevant instruments	148
5.3.2 Data Protection Convention	149
5.3.3 Draft Revised Data Protection Convention	152
5.3.4 Medical Data Protection Recommendation	154
5.3.5 Draft Revised Medical Data Protection Recommendation	155

5.4	Direct-to-consumer genetic testing in light of Article 8 of the ECHR	156
5.4.1	The assessment parameters and ECHR	156
5.4.2	Assessment parameters under the scope of Article 8 ECHR	156
5.4.2.1	The multiple facets of Article 8 ECHR	156
5.4.2.2	Integrity and self-determination	157
5.4.2.3	Private life and data protection	159
5.4.2.4	Private life and technical performance	161
5.4.3	Obligations	163
5.4.3.1	General obligations under Article 8	163
5.4.3.2	Negative obligations	164
5.4.3.3	Positive obligations	164
5.5	Concluding analysis	166
5.5.1	Recapitulation of the aim of the chapter	166
5.5.2	Council of Europe contribution to the assessment parameters: an overview	166
5.5.3	Obligations, territorial reach of instruments and the fading importance of consent	168
5.5.3.1	Nucleus of the problem	168
5.5.3.2	Considerations on state consent	169
5.5.3.3	The need for new instruments under the auspices of Council of Europe	170
5.5.3.4	The ECtHR as a legislature	171
<b>6.</b>	<b>The EU's legal space and the boundaries of the Member States' external sovereignty</b>	<b>173</b>
6.1	Introductory remarks	173
6.2	The EU's competence and authority to handle market aspects and fundamental rights	174
6.2.1	Relevant areas of competence	174
6.2.2	Internal market perspective	175
6.2.3	Fundamental rights perspective to direct-to-consumer genetic testing	177
6.2.3.1	Protection of fundamental rights in the EU legal order	177
6.2.3.2	Fundamental rights as general principles of EU law	178
6.2.3.3	From policies to legislative bases: public health and data protection	179
6.2.3.4	Fundamental rights and policies as derogations	180
6.2.3.5	Fundamental rights under international treaties	181
6.2.3.6	Fundamental rights and principles as protected by the CFREU	183

## CONTENTS

6.3	Removing barriers to free movement of direct-to-consumer genetic testing	186
6.3.1	Relevant fundamental freedoms	186
6.3.2	Which freedom? The centre of gravity assessment according to doctrine	191
6.3.3	Member States' discretion under free movement of services	193
6.4	Direct-to-consumer genetic testing as an <i>in vitro</i> diagnostic medical device	194
6.4.1	Secondary law framework for regulating direct-to-consumer genetic testing	194
6.4.2	Certain considerations of the <i>in vitro</i> diagnostic medical devices secondary law framework	195
6.4.3	Direct-to-consumer genetic testing as an <i>in vitro</i> diagnostic medical device	200
6.4.3.1	IVDMD Directive	200
6.4.3.2	The Proposed IVDMD Regulation	202
6.5	Data protection and direct-to-consumer genetic testing	203
6.5.1	Secondary law framework for data protection	203
6.5.2	Data Protection Directive	205
6.5.3	Data Protection Regulation	206
6.6	Concluding analysis	208
6.6.1	Recapitulation of the aim of the chapter	208
6.6.2	The EU's regulatory space	208
6.6.3	Secondary law	210
6.6.4	The Member States' sovereignty	212
<b>7.</b>	<b>The Council of Europe, EU, the Member States and the market assessment parameter</b>	<b>215</b>
7.1	Introductory remarks	215
7.2	Legal responses to technical performance and utility of direct-to-consumer genetic testing	216
7.2.1	Approach	216
7.2.2	Approach to quality of healthcare in the Council of Europe legal order	216
7.2.3	Approach to quality of healthcare in the EU legal order	224
7.2.3.1	Quality as a part of high level of health and safety	224
7.2.3.2	Quality and the IVDMD Directive	226
7.2.3.3	Quality and the Proposed IVDMD Regulation	229
7.3	Analytical validity	231
7.4	Clinical validity	233
7.5	Utility	236
7.6	Concluding analysis	237
7.6.1	Legal responses to the market assessment parameter	237

7.6.2	Certain considerations on the standards and common technical specifications	240
7.6.3	Certain considerations on the regulatory developments in the EU and the Member States	240
7.6.4	The Council of Europe, the EU and the Member States	242
<b>8.</b>	<b>Legal responses to the privacy assessment parameter</b>	<b>245</b>
8.1	Introductory remarks	245
8.2	Valid consent to direct-to-consumer genetic testing as a medical intervention	247
8.2.1	Approach to examining valid consent requirements	247
8.2.2	The concept of a valid consent	248
8.2.2.1	Council of Europe	248
8.2.2.2	EU	250
8.2.3	Form of consent to direct-to-consumer genetic testing	253
8.2.4	Elements of a valid consent	255
8.2.4.1	Information	255
8.2.4.2	Voluntariness	262
8.2.4.3	Capacity	264
8.2.5	Consent and adults with limited capacity	267
8.2.6	Consent and children	268
8.3	Protecting personal data in direct-to-consumer genetic testing	271
8.3.1	The principle-based approach to data protection	271
8.3.2	Lawfulness, fairness and transparency	276
8.3.2.1	Approach	276
8.3.2.2	Lawfulness	276
8.3.2.3	Fairness and transparency	282
8.3.3	Purpose limitation	283
8.3.4	Data minimization	287
8.3.5	Accuracy	289
8.3.6	Storage limitation	290
8.3.7	Integrity and confidentiality	292
8.3.8	Accountability	292
8.4	Legal responses to the fundamental rights assessment parameter	293
8.4.1	Approach	293
8.4.2	Council of Europe and the Member States	294
8.4.3	EU and the Member States	296
8.4.4	The Council of Europe, the EU and the Member States	297

## CONTENTS

<b>9. Co-existence or fragmentation?</b>	<b>299</b>
9.1 Introductory remarks	299
9.2 A fragmented legal space?	300
9.2.1 The challenging reality and direct-to-consumer genetic testing	300
9.2.2 The Council of Europe's legal order	301
9.2.2.1 An overview of the Council of Europe's contribution to addressing direct-to-consumer genetic testing	301
9.2.2.2 The sovereign and direct-to-consumer genetic testing	304
9.2.3 The EU legal order	310
9.2.3.1 The general situation	310
9.2.3.2 Member States' obligations and discretion	313
9.2.4 Interim conclusions	314
9.3 Managing the fragmented regulatory arena	315
9.3.1 Tracing the steps	315
9.3.2 Coordination and harmonization	316
9.3.2.1 Observations	316
9.3.2.2 EU law in the Council of Europe legal order	316
9.3.2.3 Council of Europe law in the EU legal order	317
9.3.3 Unification – are we there yet?	322
9.3.4 Consequences for the national legal orders	323
9.4 Final considerations	324
<b>SVENSK SAMMANFATTNING</b>	<b>327</b>
<b>BIBLIOGRAPHY</b>	<b>331</b>
<b>INDEX</b>	<b>373</b>